MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING

TA 9417: MAINSTREAMING CLIMATE RESILIENCE AND ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION FOR SECONDARY GREEN CITIES DEVELOPMENT

TA MID-TERM REVIEW MISSION, 16 APRIL 2024

I. INTRODUCTION

1. "Mainstreaming Climate Resilience and Environmental Protection for Secondary Green Cities Development" is the Technical Assistance (TA 9417) attached to the Loan Project "Secondary Green Cities Development Project" (SGCDP) in Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen. The TA total amount is USD $ 12,823,091 funded by the Global Environment Facility (GEF) and The Urban Climate Change Resilience Trust Fund (UCCRTF) through the Asian Development Bank (ADB). This is a partially delegated TA, which is jointly implemented by MONRE and ADB. Among the four TA Outputs, Outputs 1 and 4 are dedicated to MONRE for implementation and management, while Outputs 2 and 3 are administered by ADB. The Project's Executing Agency is the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment of Viet Nam (MONRE). The Pollution Control Department (PCD) is the leading Implementing Agency in cooperation with the Institute of strategy and policy on Natural Resources and Environment (ISPONRE). The overall objective of the TA project is to strengthen institutional capacity for environmental protection and climate resilience for green development of secondary cities in Viet Nam.

2. The initial Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) was made in April 2019 between the ADB project team and the MONRE project team, detailing the TA management and specifically on delegation of the TA Outputs 1 and 4. Considering the delays in project implementation and as requested by MONRE Vice Minister Vo Tuan Nhan through the official letter dated 2 June 2022, ADB approved the extension of the TA9417 closing date to 31 December 2025.

3. A midterm review mission was conducted on April 16, 2024 in Hanoi. This MOU summarizes the discussions and consensus reached between the ADB project team and MONRE project team on the project implementation status, prioritization and next steps moving forward to facilitate the TA execution. The MOU is subject to confirmation by higher authorities of the parties. A list of persons discussed this MOU is included in **Appendix 1**.

II. TA IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS

4. As of 16 April 2024, accumulative contract award is 5.4 million (42.4% of the total TA amount); $3.9 mil (30.7% of TA amount) has been disbursed. TA has reached year 5 and greater attention should be given to the TA implementation and disbursement ratio. The uncontracted balance as of 28 May 2024 is US$ 7,386,769 million. Overall TA progress is 39.9% against the TA elapsed time of 75%. The overall implementation progress is presented in Appendix 2.

A. MONRE administered Output 1 and 4

5. There are 17 technical packages under Output 1 and 4, among which, 10 packages are under implementation and 7 packages are under bidding evaluation progress, specifically:

10 packages under implementation progress:

No.	Package code	Package title	Name of the consultant	Signed Contract value (USD)	Disbursement amount as of April 2024	Contract Signing Date	Expected Contract completion date	Approved revised Contract End Date	Status of contract implementation as of April 2024
1	VEA QCBS-01	Develop legal documents guiding the implementation of the Environmental Protection Law 2020 related to environmental protection and climate change response for developing secondary green cities in Vietnam	INEST	289,824	10%	21-Sep-23	24 months	21-Sep-25	
2	VEA QCBS-02	Review and revise national technical standards on environment quality	JV EATC &RPMT.JSC	291,139	20%	20-Sep-23	24 months	20-Sep-25	
3	VEA QCBS-03	Review and revise/develop policies on sustainable consumption, environmentally friendly production and climate change adaptation for developing secondary green cities in Vietnam	VESDI	239,957	10%	28-Dec-23	24 months	28-Dec-25	

4	VEA QCBS-04	Develop the eco-label criteria, pilot and finalize the certification process for 05 products, carrying out the solutions on circular economy, sustainable/environment friendly production and consumption in the secondary cities	Hoang Kim	481,681	20% Lump sum	12-Oct-23	30 months	31 Oct 25	
5	VEA QCBS-07	Update action plan (GCAP) for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang cities and Develop air quality management plan in several project cities and pilot in at least 02 project cities	GEPTEP	286,595	40%	25-Nov-22	30 months	25 May 25	
6	VEA QCBS-08	Expand the planning with consideration to environmental quality improvement and management and climate change adaptation for the selected 03 secondary cities in the North and North Central regions	ASEC-SCSD	352,067		29-Dec-23	24 months	30-Sept-25	
7	VEA QCBS-11	Pilot at least 01 advanced technology to recycle wastes into environment-friendly products in 01 city	Joint Veture BKContech and PCC-1 WPC	438,474	50% Lump sum	28-Apr-23	30 months	28-Oct-25	

8	VEA QCBS-12	Investigate and assess the level of soil pollution at 01 polluted area due to industrial production, landfill… in service of land use conversion plan; Choose to support piloting treatment and restoration of environmental in service of land use conversion	MECIE	241,786	70%	16-Jul-22	30months	8 Feb 25	
9	ISP QCBS-02	Review and develop greenhouse gas monitoring methods and MRV monitoring guidelines; proposing a low carbon list and testing GHG inventory assessment for 03 cities (Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen	EEI	390,118	25%	16-Mar-23		30-Nov-24	Request for extension of contract till Nov 2024
10	ISP QCBS-03	Conduct capacity need assessment, develop and conduct training program for GHG inventory, low-carbon emissions, climate risk vulnerability assessment, green public procurement... for secondary cities	REEN	220,770	10%	26-Feb-24	16 months	31-May-25	

7 packages under bidding evaluation progress

No.	Package code	Package title	Package value (USD)	Status of selection process		Expected Contract Signing	Estimated Contract Duration	Expected Contract End Date
1	VEA QCBS-05	Enhancing management capacity and experience sharing on environment, land-use and climate resilience for MONRE officials	350,000	S2 to ADB		Oct 2024	24 months	Oct 2026. Potential TA extension will be discussed in the next Mission
2	VEA QCBS-06	Support to develop the environmental monitoring program, set up mechanisms for managing, information sharing environmental Database among Ministries, line agencies and local Government related project cities, pilot the environmental Program in at least 01 project city	300,000	S2 to PCD		Sept 2024	30 months	Mar 2027
3	VEA QCBS-09	Expand the planning with consideration to environmental quality improvement and management and climate change adaptation for the selected 03 secondary cities in the South and South Central regions	360,000	S3 to ADB		Jun 2024	24 months	Jun 2026

4	VEA QCBS-10	Review, evaluate the results of implementing pilot model of saving, reuse & applying new technology in wastewater treatment for a population/ urban production, business and services entities in Component 1, to replicate this model in selected cities	450,000	S3 to ADB		Sept 2024	36 months	Mar 2027
5	VEA QCBS-13	International consulting firm to provide technical assistance to VEA's activities related to urban environmental management and ISPONRE's activities related to GHG inventory, climate vulnerability assessment, developing training and communication programs	550,000	S3 to PCD				
6	ISP CQS-01	Review, develop the climate vulnerability assessment methodology, and pilot in 03 cities (Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen)	290,000	ADB NOL to S1 on 11 June 2024		Oct 2024	16 months	Dec 2026
7	ISP QCBS-04	Develop the eco-label criteria, pilot and finalize the certification process for 05 products, carrying out the solutions on circular economy, sustainable/environment friendly production and consumption in the secondary cities	400,000	ADB NOL to S3 on 10 May 2024. CSC is conducting AEE (alternative expert evaluation)		July 2024	16 months	Oct 2025

In addition to 17 technical packages, there are 09 Individual Consultant Selection packages including the newly added position ICS09.

No.	Package code	Package title	Signed Contract value (USD) up to now	Disbursement amount as of April 2024	Contract Signing Date	Original Contract End date	Extended Contract End Date	Status of contract implementation as of April 2024
1	ICS01	International Technical Advisor	190,550	127,089.80	24 Sept 2021	31 Dec 2023	31 Dec 2024	
2	ICS02	Project Manager	108,119.8	76,561.48	08 Feb 2023	30 Sept 2023	31 Dec 2024	
3	ICS03	Project Accountant	74,807	46,345.44	10 Mar 2021	31 Mar 2022	31 Dec 2024	
4	ICS04	Project Secretary cum Interpreter	79,922.26	38,203.07	22 Aug 2022	30 Apr 2023	31 Dec 2024	
5	ICS05	Project Technical Support Officer 01	105,594	62,232.31	31 Mar 2021	30 Apr 2022	31 Dec 2024	
6	ICS06	Project Technical Support Officer 02	40,604.95	27,931.17	8 Feb 2023	31 Dec 2023	31 Mar 2024	completed
7	ICS07	National consultant provides technical assistance and oversees VEA's activities related to environmental protection and management policy	72,983.11	17,814.02	22 Jul 2022	31 Dec 2023	31 Dec 2024	
8	ICS08	Project Technical Support Officer 03	56,852.92	33,498.9	22 Dec 2023	31 Dec 2024	31 Mar 2024	

9	ICS09	Project Technical Support Officer 04	40,347		03 Jun 2024	31 Dec 2025		

6. The Shopping package TA9417-VEA Sh-01 "Office equipment and financial management software" was completed in August 2021. The Auditing package TA9417-VEA FBS-14 and Monitoring and Evaluation package TA9417-VEA CQS-15 are in progress. Package TA9417-VEA FBS-14, undertaken by Nexia, has reached approximately 69% completion as of June 2024. The original contract end date was June 30, 2024; the PMU is completing a contract variation to extend it to December 31, 2025. Package TA9417-VEA CQS-15, undertaken by ADCOM, has reached 60% completion as of June 2024. The original contract end date was December 31, 2023; the PMU is completing a contract variation to extend it to December 31, 2025. Given the excessive workload of the MONRE project team, one additional individual consultant will be recruited to support the team currently consisting of one international and seven national individual consultants.

B. ADB administered Output 2 and 3

7. Under Output 2, ADB appointed a consulting firm (ICEM and Nippon Koei Joint Venture) to implement a large consulting contract to deliver most of the TA outputs under Output 2. The contract is for 24 months, from July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2023, with an extension to 31 January 2025. This TA Output 2 seeks to increase urban resilience in Ha Giang, Hue, and Vinh Yen based on a thorough understanding of the climate threats and vulnerabilities and an intelligent use of nature-based solutions (NbS) in integrated adaptation responses. There are 04 main activities under Output 2 including:

- Strengthening and greening city planning processes (completed): the consulting firm (ICEM) developed 10 new TCVN for NbS and WSUD and unit cost database for nature-based infrastructure materials and techniques.
- Demonstrating nature-based solutions (in progress): ICEM prepared 07 technical sheets for potential demonstration projects, detailed design for Vinh Yen and Hue, 03 concept designs for Ha Giang will be submitted to ADB for review in April 2024. No demonstration project has been selected for implementation at the moment due to the complicated and time-consuming Government approval procedures. The demonstration concepts will be provided to the PMUs for implementation when appropriate. A practical ongoing initiative for changing people's attitude to NbS is ICEM's partnership with Hanoi University of Civil Engineering (HUCE) for NBS Training Hub development, which is expected to provide capacity building activities to provincial and cities' officials.
- Demonstrate low-impact and climate resilient development (completed): ICEM updated climate change and hazard assessment for the 03 project cities, updated methodology for climate and hazard assessments at the urban level, and prepared Policy brief on barriers and opportunities of NBS in Vietnam's cities
- Capacity building (in progress): ICEM's preparing recommendations on activities for general environmental protection regulation and natural disaster response.

8. It is estimated that there will be around USD$500,000 savings from the equipment procurement portion under Output 2 due to the potential cancellation of all demonstration projects (due to the lengthy approvals process). This amount will be allocated to support other activities such as developing a flood model (for a new flood mitigation project in Binh Duong, for example).

9. Change of scope to Output 2 (GEF funded). The TA paper indicates that Output 2 "will provide direct technical support to the project implementing agencies and their project management units in Ha Giang, Hue, and Vinh Yen". ADB team has processed a Memo which was approved on 16 March 2024 to expand the scope of Output 2 to include a new component "(vii): develop and prepare green and climate urban investment projects in other cities".

10. Change of scope to Output 3 (UCCRTF funded). The TA paper indicates that Output 3 relates to disaster risk financing in Hue. Because the government has not and will not approve the insurance pilot, the ADB team has processed a Memo which was approved on 16 March 2024 to modify the Output 3 to read as follows: Output 3: Prepared innovative climate risk financing in Hue, climate risk flood and coastal modelling, and national policy support to improve urban climate resilience. This output will explore innovative financial mechanisms and strengthen Hue's disaster risk finance capacity by analyzing the relevant legal, financial, institutional frameworks, and formulating a necessary asset database for disaster risk finance consideration. This includes (i) providing support to formulate and/or identify an appropriate regulatory framework to purchase climate risk insurance; (ii) identifying applicability of indemnity insurance and a sustainable premium payment mechanism; (iii) asset mapping and evaluation; (iv) developing an asset management plan; and (v) market placement and knowledge sharing; (vi) preparing detailed catchment and hydrodynamic coastal models to support project preparation; and (vii) national policy support, dialogue and coordination to improve urban resilience. The TA will build upon previous studies on finding financing solutions to deal with the costs of disasters.

11. Under Output 3, as discussed above, since the pilot disaster risk insurance procurement for Thua Thien Hue province was not approved by the Government of Viet Nam due to the lack of nationally published regulations on the implementation of the law, resulting in an unallocated amount of approximately US$1.2 mil. ADB obtained SECO's agreement to re-allocate this amount to new activities including (i) Catchment and Coastal Climate Resilience measures study for Thua Thien Hue Province and (ii) Water and Urban Sector Policy Support and Dialogue (with MOC and MARD as focal agencies to review which regulations are out of date and unlock the current regulatory obstacles, facilitating the development of modern climate change and water resilience design).

12. These 2 new consulting packages: one SCQS package (US$500,000 value) for Thua Thien Hue Province" and one QCBS package (US$716,500 value) for MOC were approved and advertised publicly on ADB's website. Both packages will be administered by ADB under Output 3 and funded by UCCRTF/SECO earmarked funds.

III. OTHER IMPORTANT ITEMS

13. **Audit**: MONRE PMU advised that they have mobilized auditing consultant and committed to send ADB their 2023 APFS by 30 June 2024.

14. **Change in the Governing Procurement Policy**: Change in the governing procurement policy from the ADB's Procurement Guidelines (2015, as amended from time to time) and ADB Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time) to the 2017 Procurement Policy under TA 9417-VIE was approved. From this time forward, the 2017 Procurement Policy will only be applicable to future packages under the TA 9417 (i.e., packages which have not yet been advertised). Packages already procured, or in the process of procurement, will be governed by ADB's Procurement Guidelines (2015, as amended from time to time) and ADB Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time) throughout the duration of their contracts.

15. TA budget reallocation: both sides agreed to update the TA budget reallocation as specified on Appendix 3.

IV. GENDER ACTION PLAN

16. Under MONRE administration (Output 1 and Output 4): (i) The MONRE PMU conducted workshops on guiding the compliance with provisions of importing and using the persistent toxic substances (PTS) and articles, products, commodities and equipment containing PTS, technical meeting for revision of the national technical regulations on Surface water quality; and marine water quality, technical meeting for revision of National technical regulations on Ground water quality and the allowable limits of heavy metals in the soils, etc. for 779 participants including 373 female participants (47.8%); (ii) The package TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 "Conduct capacity need assessment, develop and conduct training program for GHG inventory, low-carbon emissions, climate risk vulnerability assessment, green public procurement... for secondary cities" contract awarded on 26 February 2024 and the training is scheduled to be started from Q1/2025; (iii) Under the package TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 "Update action plan (GCAP) for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang cities and Develop air quality management plan in several project cities and pilot in at least 02 project cities", the updated draft GCAP for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang will be completed in Q4/2024;

17. Under TA Output 2, the consulting firm ICEM conducted the training on natural edge treatment for Hue PMU, construction contractors, and construction supervision consultants in Thua Thien Hue. In collaboration with HUCE and Monash University, ICEM organized a two-week training and design contest for 31 students (including 9 females) in July 2023. The competition enabled students to explore sustainable urban design and environmental engineering, crafting climate-sensitive solutions for a campus site. The aim is to transform the site into a green, resilient learning hub, reflecting HUCE FAP's values of uniqueness, innovation, and leadership. The winning design will guide the upcoming site renovation.

18. For three project participating provinces (Ha Giang, Vinh Phuc and T.T.Hue): 286 staff including 54 women in TT Hue and Vinh Phuc participated in the trainings on improving green design, integrating climate change prevention and environmental protection to develop grade II urban areas, enhancing green design (nature-based design), provincial and green city planning, etc under TA9417. In which: Vinh Yen: 32 women among 95 participants (33.7%); TT.Hue : 22 women among 191 participants (11.5%). The staff in Ha Giang province participated in the trainings under TA8671 (4 women among 19 staff [21%]).

19. MONRE PMU is recommended to inform the GAP target of at least 33% women participate in training courses to the service consultant (TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 package) and project provinces and monitor consultant performance to ensure this target is achieved by the end of project (target 18 of GAP);

20. Ha Giang CPRP, VPMO, Hue PMU are recommended to invite both men and women in trainings on green and resilient city concept, environmental protection, climate change adaptation to ensure the achievement of GAP target (at least 33% of participants are women).

V. GEF CORE INDICATORS

21. The mission looked at the likelihood that the TA would achieve GEF outcome and impact from the DMF and the development objectives, i.e., GEF/DMF Outcome 1.1: Integrated resilient planning in 3 cities; DMF Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments; DMF Outcome 3.1: strengthened enabling institutional environment and DMF Outcome 1.2: replicating integrated and resilient planning in 6 cities. under TA Output 2, the global

environmental benefits (GEB) focal areas include 2 areas, namely (i) biodiversity and (ii) climate change. the GEB assessment report was prepared by the consulting firm ICEM and submitted to ADB for review on 10 February 2024. Under TA Output 2, 14 GEB indicators were developed.

22. Under TA Output 1 and 4, GEB focal areas include 3 areas, namely (i) biodiversity, (ii) climate change, and (iii) waste and chemical. 20 GEB indicators were developed to suit each package and contributions to GEF/DMF outcome. These 20 Indicators were discussed at the mid-term review meeting and likelihood to achieve GEB outcome and DMF impacts. Specifically, these following indicators were reviewed and will be assessed by MONRE administered technical packages.

- Number of draft environmental protection policy (GEF/DMF outcome 1.1)
- Number of draft environmental standards/TCVN/QCVN/ technical regulations (GEF/DMF outcome 1.1)
- Number of draft sustainable production & consumption policies (DMF outcome 2.1)
- Number of draft eco-label criteria (GEF/DMF outcome 1.1)
- Number of beneficiaries/land areas though application of waste recycling technology (GEF/DMF outcome 2.1)
- Number of beneficiaries and proportion of woman with enhanced capacity in environment, land use, climate resilience (GEF/DMF outcome 3.1)
- Number of draft technical guidelines on environmental monitoring (GEF/DMF outcome 1.1)
- Number of people benefiting from GCAP implementation in Hue, Vinh Yen, Ha giang (GEF/DMF outcome 1.1) This indicator will be estimated based on the updated draft.
- Number of people benefiting from GCAP implementation in 6 additional cities (GEF/DMF outcome 1.2)
- Increased green investment over next 10 years (GEF/DMF outcome 2.1). The MONRE PMU will estimate how many percentages increased.
- Number of people benefiting from the pilot model of domestic water treatment with new technology (GEF/DMF outcome 2.1)
- Number of recommendations to replicate pilot models on saving and reuse urban wastewater (GEF/DMF outcome 3.1)
- Number of people benefiting from pilot model of recycling plastic waste (GEF/DMF outcome 2.1)
- Area of contaminated land piloted for treatment (GEF/DMF outcome 2.1)
- Number of people benefiting from communication program (GEF/DMF outcome 3.1)
- Number of people reached by training and capacity development by for MONRE agencies (GEF/DMF outcome 3.1)
- Number of technical guidelines/ assessments on CVA in 3 cities Hue, Vinh Yen, and Ha Giang (GEF/DMF outcome 1.1)
- Number of technical guidelines/ assessments on GHG inventory in Hue, Vinh Yen, Ha Giang (GEF/DMF outcome 1.1)
- Number of participants attending training on to GHG inventory, CVA, circular economy, green public procurement (GEF/DMF outcome 3.1)
- Number of participants/interactions in communication events in GHG inventory, CVA, circular economy, green public procurement (GEF/ DMF outcome 3.1)

VI. CHALLENGES AND SUGGESTIONS TO OVERCOME

23. Challenge 1: Time constraint in proposal evaluation: the approval process entails evaluations by both ADB and PCD, demanding substantial time and human resources. ADB team informed the PMU about its recent operational changes, requesting all procurement transactions to be assigned to ADB HQ (PPFD), effective from 1 April 2024. It was agreed that the proposal evaluation process would be accelerated and processed within 2 weeks of submission date on average.

24. Challenge 2: Updating TORs/ Contract Variations during the contract implementation: with 10 packages currently in the implementation stage, it has been identified that during the development of the Inception Report, it is necessary to update the deliverables specified in the original TORs to maintain alignment with the current context and regulations. According to ADB's PAI 2.06, MONRE PMU needs ADB NOL only for price changes of 15% or more. ADB's PAI 2.06 para 42 states: "*The EA approves all variations in consultants' contracts and may consult the user unit and ADB procurement staff on an as-needed basis. The EA shall seek ADB's no-objection, from the director of the user unit, where any modification would individually or in aggregate increase the original price of the contract by more than 15%. To ensure that the contract variation is not considered an attempt to circumvent sanctions, OAI endorsement should be sought and obtained prior to approving any contract variation to a sanctioned firm or individual*". ADB team advised the PMU not to make significant changes to the consultants' scope which would have the effect of **changing the level of effort** by more than 15% (even if there were no price change) without seeking ADB's NoL. For other minor changes, such as bank account details, contract completion dates, milestone delivery dates, changes in VAT rates applicable, changes in staffing), it was agreed that the PMU could document these variations and seek ADB's post-review.

25. Challenge 3: Packages with equipment and material procurement: for the four packages that include equipment and material procurement (VEA QCBS-04, 06, 10, and 11), will be procured by the consultant on behalf of the MONRE PMU requires clarification and agreement on the procedures to be used. After extensive discussions and technical support from relevant agencies, it was agreed that consulting firms would carry out the procurement process according to ADB procurement guidelines, with technical support and supervision from PMU, with ADB being kept updated. For procurement packages under $100,000, consulting firms can use the Request for Quotation (RFQ) procurement method[1] described in ADB's procurement guidelines (2015, as amended from time to time). For off-the shelf or standard specification equipment slightly over $100,000, the PMU may request ADB to approve RFQ as a procurement method in exceptional cases. The procured equipment will be handed over to MONRE or its designated operator. The ADB team advised that a tripartite agreement involving the consulting firm, PMU and its designated operator could be arranged for the handover. Ensuring all necessary documents are prepared for receiving the equipment is crucial. ADB has a handover template and will provide it to PMU when required.

VII. TA EXTENSION

26. TA Savings: The PMU informed ADB team that an amount of approximately USD$550,000 would be saved from bidding packages. This unused amount could be utilized with either a new package creation or capacity training activities (TA Output dissemination, for example). It was

[1] Previously known as "shopping" in the 2015 Procurement Guidelines

noted that a new package creation will require PP update following Vietnamese procurement regulations, which is complicated and time consuming. ADB noted that if the savings were not disbursed by the end of the TA, they would be refunded to the donor (GEF).

27. TA extension. The ADB project team noted there are several on-going contracts with the contract completion dates go beyond the current TA closing date (i.e. 31 December 2025) under the MONRE delegated outputs. In addition, 7 CS packages are under selection process, and it is unlikely that these contracts can be completed by end of December 2025. The ADB team advised MONRE PMU to explore the possibility of the 2nd extension of the TA closing date to complete the original activities since the 3 PPMUs of the associated loans (Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Phuc) are now requesting to extend the associated loans to 30 June 2028. MONRE PMU acknowledged this option and will further discuss with ADB team when they have a clearer guidance from the management. ADB team advised that final decision should be made in Sept/Oct 2024 and the request for extension should be submitted in Nov/Dec 2024 so that ADB team has sufficient time to process and secure approval from ADB management.

VIII. NEXT STEPS

28. The ADB team and MONRE PMU agreed that the next review is tentatively scheduled for March 2025.

For Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment	For Asian Development Bank
Le Hoai Nam Deputy Director General Pollution Control Department MONRE PMU Project Deputy Director	Alexander D. Nash Senior Urban Development Specialist, SG-WUD, Team Leader

Appendix 1
List of persons met

From ADB side:

1. Mr. Alexander David Nash, Senior Urban Development Specialist
2. Ms. Cao Thu Hang, Project Analyst
3. Mr. Vu Hoang Cuong, M&E Expert, Consultant
4. Ms. Tran Thuy Hai, Gender Expert, Consultant
5. Ms. Nguyen Quynh Anh, Project Analyst, Consultant

From MONRE side:

1. Mr. Le Hoai Nam, PCD Deputy Director, PMU Deputy Director
2. Ms. Tran Thi Hien Hanh, Project Coordinator, PCD Official
3. Ms. Duong Hong Lien, Chief Accountant, PCD Official.
4. Ms. Tran Thi Thu Huong, PM
5. Ms. Nguyen Ngoc Anh, PSI
6. Mr. Bui Phan Quoc Nghia, PO
7. Ms. Dao Hong Thu, PO
8. Ms. Dang Bich Hong, PA
9. Mr. Nguyen Trung Thang, Deputy Director of ISPONRE/PMU National Deputy Director
10. Ms. Kim Thi Thuy Ngoc, Head, Division of Science and International cooperation, ISPONRE
11. Ms. Doan Ngoc Khanh, Official, Division of Science and International cooperation, ISPONRE

Appendix 2
TA overall implementation progress

TA9417: Overall implementation progress	39.9%		
MONRE administered Output 1 (27.3%)	**(a) Assigned weight (%)**	**(b) Actual progress (%)**	**(a)x(b) Weighted progress (%)**
Establishing the policy framework and technical framework for environmental protection	15.6%	25.0%	3.9%
Establishing the policy framework and technical framework for climate change	7.9%	12.5%	1.0%
Enhancing management capacity, knowledge management and experience sharing	3.8%	0.0%	0.0%
Implementation progress of output 1			4.9%
ADB administered Output 2 (23.7%)	**(a) Assigned weight (%)**	**(b) Actual progress (%)**	**(a)x(b) Weighted progress (%)**
Mobilization of the consultant to support increase of urban resilience in Ha Giang, Hue, and Vinh Yen	5.7%	100%	5.7%
Strengthening and greening city planning processes	5%	100%	5.0%
Demonstrating nature-based solutions	5%	100%	5.0%
Demonstrate low-impact and climate resilient development	5%	100%	5.0%
Improved capacity in integrated and resilient development approaches	3%	60%	1.8%
Implementation progress of output 2			22.5%
ADB administered Output 3 (15.6%)	**(a) Assigned weight (%)**	**(b) Actual progress (%)**	**(a)x(b) Weighted progress (%)**
Mobilization of the consultant for innovative climate risk financing in Hue	1.2%	100%	1.2%
Identificaction of public asset mapping and analysis	1.2%	100%	1.2%
Disaster insurance feasibility assessment	1.2%	100%	1.2%
Disaster insurance cover prepared (tested removed from scope due to Government unwillingness to approve purchase)	1.2%	100%	1.2%
Capacity development and knowledge dissemination	1.2%	100%	1.2%
Additional consulting activites to support Hue and MOC	9.4%	10%	0.9%
Implementation progress of output 3	15.6%		7.2%
MONRE administered Output 4 (33.4%)	**(a) Assigned weight (%)**	**(b) Actual progress (%)**	**(a)x(b) Weighted progress (%)**
Develop urban environmental protection solutions integrated into provincial master plan to update GCAPs and apply GCAPs for new secondary cities	11.0%	20.0%	2.2%
Pilot advanced technologies for environmental protection, including developing an environmental monitoring program, recycling waste, treating wastewater, and remediating polluted soil	14.7%	21.3%	3.1%
Implement capacity enhancement for environmental protection and climate change resilience in relevant with updating green city implementation plan	7.7%	0.05%	0.004%
Implementation progress of output 4			5.3%

Appendix 3
Updated TA budget reallocation

TA9417: Updated TA budget allocation							
AdministeredBy	(All)						
Output	(All)						
Sum of Value (USD) as fx specified on PD			ADB & MONRE	*(ADB only)*	*(ADB only)*	*(ADB only)*	ADB & MONRE
Fund	**CoA Orde**	**TA Budget Desc**	**Allocation - Original**	**Allocation - June 2021**	**Allocation - Nov 2023**	**Allocation - Mar 2024**	**Proposed Allocation - June 2024***
GEF Fund Trust - 48	1	Consultants					
	1.01	Remuneration and per diem					
	1.02	i. International consultants	964,500		890,000		1,064,500
	1.03	ii. National consultants	2,346,898		700,000		2,576,898
	1.04	International and local travel	456,657		200,000		456,657
	1.05	Report and communications	75,000		60,000		74,545
	2	Training, seminars, and conferences	185,948		35,000		785,948
	3	Surveys	457,866		75,000		333,540
	4	Miscellaneous administration and support cost	122,656		75,000		122,656
	5	Equipment	1,289,607		100,000		534,388
	6	Contingencies	357,748		100,881		103,581
	7	Other					204,167
GEF Fund Trust - 48 Total			**6,256,881**		**2,235,881**		**6,256,881**
GEF Special - Climate Change Fund - 5F	1	Consultants					
	1.01	Remuneration and per diem					
	1.02	i. International consultants	2,408,900		350,000		656,850
	1.03	ii. National consultants	735,102		250,000		1,915,088
	1.04	International and local travel	161,143		65,000		207,088
	1.05	Report and communications	75,000		-		250,710
	2	Training, seminars, and conferences	114,052		20,000		479,399
	3	Surveys	542,134		15,000		293,436
	4	Miscellaneous administration and support cost	177,344		5,000		109,831
	5	Equipment	210,393		-		227,272
	6	Contingencies	142,143		102,210		102,210
	7	Other	-		-		324,326
GEF Special - Climate Change Fund - 5F Total			**4,566,210**		**807,210**		**4,566,210**
UCCRTF - 5Z	1	Consultants					
	1.01	Remuneration and per diem					
	1.02	i. International consultants	135,000	500,000	500,000	1,000,000	1,000,000
	1.03	ii. National consultants	80,000	225,000	225,000	610,000	610,000
	1.04	International and local travel	45,000	75,000	75,000	205,000	205,000
	1.05	Report and communications	10,000	10,000	10,000	10,000	10,000
	2	Training, seminars, and conferences	60,000	30,000	30,000	40,000	40,000
	3	Surveys	1,500,000	30,000	30,000	130,000	130,000
	4	Miscellaneous administration and support cost	10,000	20,000	20,000	5,000	5,000
	5	Equipment	10,000	10,000	10,000	-	-
	6	Contingencies	150,000	100,000	100,000	-	-
	7	Other				-	-
	8	Pilot Testing		1,000,000	1,000,000	-	-
UCCRTF - 5Z Total			**2,000,000**	**2,000,000**	**2,000,000**	**2,000,000**	**2,000,000**
			12,823,091				**12,823,091**

** The MONRE proposed allocation in June 2024 will be further reviewed and approved by ADB through a minor change Memo.*